Financial Reform: The End of International Coordination?
Discussion of presentations of Avinash Persaud, Nicolas Veron and Aditya Narain

Comments by Olena Havrylchyk, CEPII

September 16, 2010
International Cooperation in Times of Global Crisis: Views from G20 countries
We are observing the tightening of the financial regulation and there are worries that this might affect growth.
We are observing the tightening of the financial regulation and there are worries that this might affect growth.

The relationship between finance and growth is very complex: More does not mean better.
We are observing the tightening of the financial regulation and there are worries that this might affect growth.

The relationship between finance and growth is very complex: More does not mean better.

1. Low inflation
   - Finance leads to growth if inflation is less than 6-8 percent. Financial sector expansion that results from inflationary liquidity creation or deteriorating in lending standards will not enhance long-run growth prospects (Wachtel, 2001).
We are observing the tightening of the financial regulation and there are worries that this might affect growth.

The relationship between finance and growth is very complex: More does not mean better.

1. Low inflation
   ▶ Finance leads to growth if inflation is less than 6-8 percent. Financial sector expansion that results from inflationary liquidity creation or deteriorating in lending standards will not enhance long-run growth prospects (Wachtel, 2001).

2. Efficiency and high lending standards
   ▶ Quality of banks’ loan portfolio and efficiency and not sheer volumes of credit are key elements in the channel though which finance propagates growth (Jayaratne and Strahan, 1996).
   ▶ Qualitative measures of financial institutions are 5 times more important than quantitative ones (Hasan et al., 2009).
We are observing the tightening of the financial regulation and there are worries that this might affect growth.

The relationship between finance and growth is very complex: More does not mean better.

1. Low inflation
   ▶ Finance leads to growth if inflation is less than 6-8 percent. Financial sector expansion that results from inflationary liquidity creation or deteriorating in lending standards will not enhance long-run growth prospects (Wachtel, 2001).

2. Efficiency and high lending standards
   ▶ Quality of banks' loan portfolio and efficiency and not sheer volumes of credit are key elements in the channel though which finance propagates growth (Jayaratne and Strahan, 1996).
   ▶ Qualitative measures of financial institutions are 5 times more important than quantitative ones (Hasan et al., 2009).

3. Credit composition
   ▶ Firm lending has an impact on growth, while household lending does not (Beck et al., 2009).
How do current reforms impact efficiency/competition in the banking market?

- Higher capitalization: Reduces moral hazard and risky lending. Good for bank-efficiency thanks to lower cost of funding and could be passed on to customers in competitive markets.
- Countercyclical capital or loan loss provisions?
  - Bank levy/tax/fees: Depends on the design. A flat rate for all banks could be passed on to customers. A rate that depends on the bank's contribution to financial stability could counteract the implicit subsidy for large institutions that have much lower funding costs.
  - If fund is used to bail-out weak banks, this would decrease competition and increases moral hazard. If fund is used to resolve insolvent institutions and compensate solvent institutions, this would decrease moral hazard and increases competition.
- Resolution fund vs. Bail-out fund!
How do current reforms impact efficiency/competition in the banking market?

- Higher capitalization: Reduces moral hazard and risky lending. Good for bank-efficiency thanks to lower cost of funding and could be passed on to customers in competitive markets.
How do current reforms impact efficiency/competition in the banking market?

- Higher capitalization: Reduces moral hazard and risky lending. Good for bank-efficiency thanks to lower cost of funding and could be passed on to customers in competitive markets.
- Countercyclical capital or loan loss provisions??
How do current reforms impact efficiency/competition in the banking market?

- Higher capitalization: Reduces moral hazard and risky lending. Good for bank-efficiency thanks to lower cost of funding and could be passed on to customers in competitive markets.
- Countercyclical capital or loan loss provisions?
- Bank levy/tax/fees: Depends on the design.
  - Flat rate for all banks could be passed on to customers. Rate that depends on the bank’s contribution to financial stability could counteract the implicit subsidy for large institutions that have much lower funding costs.
  - If fund is used to bail-out weak banks, this would decrease competition and increases moral hazard. If fund is used to resolve insolvent institutions and compensate solvent institutions, this would decrease moral hazard and increases competition.

Resolution fund vs. Bail-out fund!
What is being currently proposed to increase bank efficiency?

- Not much! However, it is exactly in this area where national regulation could be active.
What is being currently proposed to increase bank efficiency?

- Not much! However, it is exactly in this area where national regulation could be active.
- A good indicator of market competitions is its profits.
What is being currently proposed to increase bank efficiency?

- Not much! However, it is exactly in this area where national regulation could be active.
- A good indicator of market competitions is its profits.
- Example of the EU: price of the core retail banking services: 34 Euros in Netherlands and 252 Euros in Italy. Competition index: almost perfect competition in Netherlands and almost monopoly in Italy (Claessens et al., 2004).
What is being currently proposed to increase bank efficiency?

- Not much! However, it is exactly in this area where national regulation could be active.
- A good indicator of market competitions is its profits.
- Example of the EU: price of the core retail banking services: 34 Euros in Netherlands and 252 Euros in Italy. Competition index: almost perfect competition in Netherlands and almost monopoly in Italy (Claessens et al., 2004).
- Given that liberalization has already taken place in many countries, more subtle steps are necessary to enhance competition, such as portable account numbers to overcome high switching costs (which amount to 1/3 of lending rates, "bargain then rip-off strategy"), increased transparency, credit bureaus.
What is being currently proposed to increase bank efficiency?

- Not much! However, it is exactly in this area where national regulation could be active.
- A good indicator of market competitions is its profits.
- Example of the EU: price of the core retail banking services: 34 Euros in Netherlands and 252 Euros in Italy. Competition index: almost perfect competition in Netherlands and almost monopoly in Italy (Claessens et al., 2004).
- Given that liberalization has already taken place in many countries, more subtle steps are necessary to enhance competition, such as portable account numbers to overcome high switching costs (which amount to 1/3 of lending rates, "bargain then rip-off strategy"), increased transparency, credit bureaus.
- Some countries have succeeded to lessen the impact of the crisis thanks to national regulatory measures or supervisory actions.
Thank you!